

428. But it would not prevent the channel being kept open?—There would be always a channel.

429. By which a small steamer might pass in?—Yes.

430. But she would have a difficulty in doing so?—She might have a difficulty in turning round.

431. But she would have to hit the channel very accurately, or she would go ashore?—Yes.

432. In any case you think there should be a turn of 100ft.?—No; that would make it worse than ever.

433. Why?—Because the turn would be in the wrong place.

434. You base that opinion on the fact that the work as proposed does not go out far enough?—Yes.

435. But still you think that Captain Sinclair may be right—that, unless in fine weather, a vessel could not lie alongside on account of the swell, which would make the vessel bump against the breakwater?—Yes.

436. *Mr. Graham.*] Have you any idea of the quantity of sand that would get round?—I have not.

437. If it were demonstrated to you that there was very little sand there, that would get rid of Captain Sinclair's objection, would it not?—Yes, to a great extent.

438. Suppose there was not any sand coming through, would that meet the objection?—Yes, if it could be proved.

439. *Mr. Thomson* says there is no travelling sand there at all?—I think that, after being there for two or three years, he would be likely to be correct, having carefully examined the place. When he first planned the work he had been only about four months there. What Captain Sinclair speaks of is going on at the mouth of almost every river, more or less.

440. *The Chairman.*] If the work is carried the full length is it your opinion that would prevent the sand coming round altogether?—If the work was carried out and completed I presume not.

*Mr. Ross :* But, according to the evidence, it is banking up slowly.

*The Chairman :* What is presumed in Captain Sinclair's evidence is that if the work is carried out only to this distance the sand would still come round.

*Mr. Whyte :* If there were a fiftieth part of the sand here that is usually found on the other parts of the coast, I would not think for a moment of supporting this scheme.

*Mr. Ross :* Captain Sinclair says there is a backwash by which the sand is taken back—that is, round again.

*Mr. Graham :* He said so.

*Mr. Allen :* It is most people's experience of rivers and harbours that the sand begins to work round when the ordinary flow and ebb of the tide is interrupted.

*Mr. Graham :* That is, if you have a large-enough supply of sand; but this bay is a very small bay, so that you might presume there was no large supply, suppose that sand does travel in one particular direction: but there is scarcely anything but papa rock on the eastern side.

*Mr. Whyte :* Practically, the quantity of sand that you have to contend with here is worth very little consideration compared with that in other works of this kind.

*The Chairman :* But it must be taken as a fact that there is sand here to form this spit.

*Mr. Graham :* The idea is that it must have come from the papa rock; but that is as bare as my hand.

441. *Mr. Allen.*] The sand on the beach—where does that come from?—That would probably be thrown up from the bottom. Captain Sinclair says it comes in from the south-east to this bank.

*Mr. Graham :* There is very little.

*Mr. Whyte :* There are not as many barrels of it as there are hundreds of thousands of tons at New Plymouth.

442. *The Chairman.*] Have you, Mr. Blackett, seen Mr. Higginson's report?—Yes.

443. He says that as the work stands at present it would be useless, and taking all circumstances into consideration he recommends that an extension should be made to such a distance that it would be of some use, and that they should be allowed to spend £40,000 for that purpose. If I understand you aright you would not make a recommendation of that kind. That it would be useful in fine weather is all that you can say, even with that extension?—Yes.

*Mr. Whyte :* That is the opinion of an engineer; but Mr. Blackett might give us more information as to the necessity of this work—as to the trade of the place.

*Mr. Blackett :* I can give no opinion upon that.

*The Chairman :* He would not recommend the expenditure of this £40,000.

*Mr. Whyte :* I think we would be entitled to the information and knowledge that a businessman would have of the trade of the port.

*The Chairman :* Mr. Blackett says that he is of Captain Sinclair's opinion, that vessels would be able to lie alongside only in fine weather.

444. *Mr. Graham.*] How far along the breakwater would that apply?—Several hundred feet.

445. *The Chairman.*] Captain Sinclair says vessels would bump against the pier and be injured in rough weather: is that your opinion, Mr. Blackett?—Yes.

446. Will you please supply the Committee with a copy of Mr. Thomson's report and your memorandum in reference thereto?—Yes.

Mr. A. GRAHAM, M.H.R., further examined.

*Mr. Graham* asked to be allowed to make a statement to the Committee:—As to Captain Sinclair's evidence, I do not suppose that in one out of every ten trips he comes ashore at Gisborne. With reference to the opinion of Mr. Blackett as regards the sand coming in, I think Mr. Blackett