

Paragraph 12: The Actuary has here entirely misrepresented (no doubt unintentionally) what I wished to convey, and has distorted my words in placing upon them the assumption he has.

I am certainly at issue with the Actuary in his remarks that it is "necessary not only to provide the money for the pensions which are payable during the year, but to constitute a fund from which to pay eventually the pensions to men now on the active strength of the Force as they fall in." If his contention is correct, then what is to be done with the annual income of £8,000 named in the final sub-paragraph of paragraph 5?

That it would be necessary to have a considerable balance to carry forward each year, for a good many years to come, I admit, and the figures I gave in my report indicated that there would be such a balance.

Paragraph 13 (1): As regards the figures quoted by the Actuary in this paragraph, all I can say is that if I have shown that some at least of his deductions are not borne out by facts the whole of his report is more or less vitiated thereby.

(2.) The Actuary in this sub-paragraph draws attention to the deficiency in the New South Wales Civil Service Superannuation Fund, and quotes Mr. Coghlan's report of 1894.

I think it is to be regretted that the Actuary was contented to make the bald assertion that this Fund had a huge deficiency, and omitted to state that Mr. Coghlan, in the same report, gave as one reason for the deficiency that the Superannuation Fund had been used for purposes never anticipated by its authors. The following paragraph appears in Mr. Coghlan's report, and will speak for itself:—

"The authors of the scheme could never have anticipated that the Fund would become the sport of political necessities when they framed the clause entitling to the benefits of the fund any persons whose offices were abolished by the Government. Wholesale additions to the pension list have at times been made in furtherance of a retrenchment policy, and since the commencement no less than 272 have, for this reason, been placed prematurely among the ranks of pensioners, representing an annual expense to the Fund of £36,212."

The contributions of the members of the New South Wales Superannuation Fund is only 4 per cent of their salary.

Paragraph 14. In connection with the Actuary's remarks under this head, I desire to state that I do not wish my name to be associated with any scheme that is likely to be a failure.

Independent of the figures of the Actuary, I have from certain calculations, made under my own direction, come to the conclusion that the scheme, as drawn up by me, was too liberal.

I am now quite prepared to accept the Actuary's suggestions under sub-headings 1 and 2, and recommend that the draft Bill be altered accordingly.

(3.) If the Workers' Compensation Act can be accepted as an equivalent to the benefits these cases would receive from the Fund, then by all means let this suggestion also be adopted. Judging, however, from the past, there would be very few cases indeed that would come under the category in question.

(4.) I do not see how the necessary machinery to meet each case could be set up in the Bill; besides, it is to do justice to the older men in the Force that the Act is asked for.

Paragraph 15. To prepare the data, &c., named herein would mean abandoning the Bill so far as the present session of Parliament is concerned.

J. B. TUNBRIDGE,
Commissioner of Police.

TABLE showing Examples worked out at 5 per Cent., 10 per Cent., and 18 per Cent., with £1 per Annum added for Emoluments, with Interest at $3\frac{1}{2}$ per Cent., showing Annuities purchasable.

Example.	Years served.	Amounts realised.			Age.	Annuities purchasable.			Pensions.	
		5 per Cent.	10 per Cent.	18 per Cent.		5 per Cent.	10 per Cent.	18 per Cent.	Rate.	Amount.
1. Constable for 30 years ..	30	£ s. d. 426 0 0	£ s. d. 801 9 11	£ s. d. 1,442 13 10	55	£ s. d. 34 5 10	£ s. d. 64 10 5	£ s. d. 116 2 9	30/50	£ s. d. 98 11 0
Compensation ..	..	164 5 0	164 5 0	164 5 0	..	13 4 5	13 4 5	13 4 5	30/60	82 2 6
21 % added ..	..	590 5 0	965 14 11	1,606 18 10	..	47 10 3	77 14 10	129 7 2		
	..	..	..	..	..	9 19 6	16 16 6	27 3 1		
	..				..	57 9 9	94 1 4	156 10 3		
2. Constable, 15 years ..	30	452 12 11	854 15 9	1,538 11 5	55	36 8 9	68 16 2	123 17 1	30/50	120 9 0
Sergeant, 15 years, compensation ..	..	200 15 0	200 15 0	200 15 0	..	16 3 3	16 3 3	16 3 3	30/60	100 7 6
21 % added ..	..	653 7 11	1,055 10 9	1,739 6 5	..	52 12 0	84 19 5	140 0 4		
	..	..	..	..	..	11 0 10	17 17 0	29 8 0		
	..				..	63 12 10	102 16 5	169 8 4		
3. Constable, 15 years ..	30	466 17 4	883 4 7	1,589 16 10	55	37 10 11	71 0 8	127 17 2	30/50	143 5 4
Sergeant, 10 years, compensation ..	..	520 0 0	520 0 0	520 0 0	..	42 13 2	42 13 2	42 13 2	30/60	119 7 10
Sub-Inspector, 5 years ..	..	986 17 4	1,403 4 7	2,109 16 10	..	80 4 1	113 13 10	170 10 4		
21 % added ..	..	..	..	..	..	16 16 10	23 17 3	35 16 2		
	..				..	97 0 11	137 11 1	206 6 6		
4. Constable, 15 years ..	30	481 17 5	913 4 9	1,643 16 6	55	38 15 9	73 10 2	132 6 2	30/50	164 11 4
Sergeant, 7 years, compensation ..	..	600 0 0	600 0 0	600 0 0	..	48 6 0	48 6 0	48 6 0	30/60	137 2 10
Sub-Inspector, 5 years ..	..	1,081 17 5	1,513 4 9	2,243 16 6	..	87 1 9	121 16 2	180 12 2		
Inspector, 3 years, 21 % added ..	..	..	..	..	..	18 5 6	25 11 6	37 18 6		
	..				..	105 7 3	147 7 8	218 10 8		