

*The Chairman:* You can ask Mr. Beattie any questions you wish to now, Mr. Carter.

126. *Mr. Carter.*] When I took that engine to Addington to have the necessary alterations made, do not you remember taking notes of what I would like to have done to the engine, and do not you remember taking notice of that tender-brake that did not work, and you stooped down and pulled the lever open and asked me to get up on the engine and put the brake on?—I do not recollect that at all.

127. The engine was standing outside the Addington workshops, and you told me to go up and put the brake on after you had pulled the lever back. The brake did not go on, and then you said, "I will try it, and have a look if it goes on." You went up and tried it, and it never went on?—I have not the slightest recollection of that.

128. You took notes down of what I asked you—of what I would like to have seen to?—Why did not you report a list of these things? What was the good of taking the chance of seeing me?

129. I had just come in from Ashburton with the midday train. Mr. Dickenson asked me to take the engine away to the shops, and you were the first man that came to the engine. You took your pocketbook out and took notes down, and I mentioned there was the slotted brake-blocks; you passed some remark yourself about it?—I can be most positive in that denial. The slotted-blocks I do not disapprove of, and therefore that carries its own contradiction. I positively deny that, and that strengthens my denial of the previous occurrence.

130. At the same time, did not I say that I would like the smoke-box, and to put our own spark-rests in?—I have not a shadow of recollection of it.

131. Have you a book of the notes that you took down on that day. I think you mentioned the date?—The 4th of January was the day the engine went into the shed. I have no entry beyond the fact that I was at Christchurch.

132. Was that the book you had?—Yes.

133. You took notes of all that I asked you, and you asked me whether there were any other improvements that I would like to have done to the foot-plate?—I am afraid, Carter, that you have been dreaming. I deny that.

134. *The Chairman.*] Was there any one present besides yourself and Carter?—My fireman was there, but he was busy.

135. *Mr. Taylor.*] Was Mr. Felton there?

*Mr. Carter:* He came some time afterwards. Mr. Beattie was there first, then they were all there afterwards.

136. *Mr. Carter.*] About the notice that I received. I had the running-orders, before I left with that special, for Christchurch to Ashburton and back, but I consider I should have had further orders when the train arrangements were altered. I left Ashburton sixteen minutes late by my own time, and twenty minutes by the Stationmaster's time. I did not get any alteration as to the running at Chertsey?—Well, seeing that the crossing and the train-running was not altered, I do not see any need for revised running. He was still working to this crossing-place. It is not usual to give a revised time-table to a man every time he is late. It was unnecessary to give him any further instructions than he had. He was still working to the time-table he received, and the crossings were not altered.

137. Is there not a rule to this effect: when an alteration of the running is made—of a train running late—the Stationmaster should give notice as to the alterations of other trains that he has got to meet, if other trains ahead of him are delayed?—If the crossing is altered the driver would get notice; if it were not altered his previous instructions would stand good.

138. I have nothing to refer to but the rule-book. I have known times where I have had written instructions from the Stationmasters where I have had another train in front of me. I thought it would apply in my case?—In my opinion it would not apply in this case.

139. *Mr. Laury.*] What does Mr. Beattie mean by the crossing being the same. Does that apply to the locality of the crossing, or the time?—Locality, sir, the station at which the crossing is to be made.

140. Then it does not matter what time he comes to that crossing. What I mean is this: Mr. Carter said he started twenty minutes late. Would it matter if he were twenty minutes late?—Unless he got orders to the contrary he would observe that time-table on which he was working. He would have no authority to alter that without written instructions.

141. He could not be at that crossing before the stipulated time, but if he started late would it have affected the position?—No, so long as the crossing was not altered. Supposing it had been desired to make the crossing at Chertsey—you must remember there was another train crossing at Chertsey—therefore, Chertsey was preoccupied.

142. If he started twenty minutes late there would be nothing in the regulations to prevent him making up that time so as not to be twenty minutes late at the crossing?—Nothing whatever, so long as he did not exceed his maximum speed.

143. *Mr. Flatman.*] I think it has been alleged that the train that was driven by Mr. Carter ought to have stopped at Chertsey. Where would the Chertsey Stationmaster have received that information, or who would have been in authority to give that information?—The Chertsey Stationmaster did not get any instructions to stop the train.

144. There was no need to stop the train at Chertsey?—No need whatever.

145. *Mr. E. G. Allen.*] Would it not have been advisable to have stopped the train so as to tell the driver the guard had missed his passage at Ashburton?—No, not necessarily; and the mere fact of the senior guard missing his passage at Ashburton simply resulted in the junior guard taking his place in the van. It is said in the Royal Commission Report, "It is not apparent that his absence in any way led to the subsequent accident."