

- (c.) That it was agreed that Mr Wilson should receive the sum of £165 for his services.
- (d.) Mr. Wilson accordingly made such inspection and report, and rendered the aforesaid services, and was paid the sum of £165 for his work.
- (e.) That the said T. K. Macdonald at divers times applied for payment for his services as assessor in the Flaxbourne arbitration case, claiming remuneration of about £500 or £600, on the basis of the fee paid to Clifford's assessor.
- (f.) That payment of the claim of the Hon. T. K. Macdonald was personally declined by Sir Joseph Ward, on the ground that there was no written record of any arrangement in regard thereto made with the late Mr. Seddon; and this refusal to pay the claim was, on the 23rd May, 1908, confirmed by Cabinet.

Finding

4. The Committee is of opinion that Mr. A. L. Wilson duly rendered and performed the aforesaid services, and was regularly and properly paid therefor in accordance with the authority for payment approved by the late Mr. Seddon, and that such payment was not made with the intent or object of indirectly remunerating the Hon. Mr. Macdonald, either alone, or as partner of the late firm of Macdonald, Wilson, and Co., or of remunerating Mr. A. L. Wilson for the services of the said T. K. Macdonald as such assessor as aforesaid.

Paragraph 1 Moved by Mr. Massey, to strike out the word "of" after the word "Government," and after the word "which" strike out the words "the late Right Honourable Mr. Seddon was Prime Minister," and insert the words "was in office in 1904" in lieu thereof.

On the motion being put, the Committee divided, and the names were taken down as follow:—

Ayes, 4.—Mr. Allen, Mr. Buchanan, Mr. Fraser, Mr. Massey

Noes, 5.—Mr. Graham, Mr. Hanan, Hon. Mr. Millar, Mr. Myers, Mr. Reed.

So it passed in the negative.

Paragraph agreed to.

Paragraph 2 read and agreed to.

Paragraph 3 (a.) Moved by Mr. Allen, to strike out the words "(the late Right Hon. Mr. Seddon being then Minister in Charge of the Land Purchase Department.)"

On the question being put, the Committee divided, and the names were taken down as follow:—

Ayes, 4.—Mr. Allen, Mr. Buchanan, Mr. Fraser, Mr. Massey

Noes, 5.—Mr. Graham, Mr. Hanan, Hon. Mr. Millar, Mr. Myers, Mr. Reed.

So it passed in the negative.

Mr. Allen moved to strike out the word "Seddon" before the word "Government."

On the question being put, the Committee divided, and the names were taken down as follow:—

Ayes, 4.—Mr. Allen, Mr. Buchanan, Mr. Fraser, Mr. Massey

Noes, 5.—Mr. Graham, Mr. Hanan, Hon. Mr. Millar, Mr. Myers, Mr. Reed.

So it passed in the negative.

Moved by Mr. Massey, to insert after the word "area" the words "with a proportionate reduction in the amount of the claim."

Mr. Massey withdrew his motion.

Resolved, on the motion of the Hon. Mr. Millar, to strike out the words "and the right of the owners to reserve out of the estate a certain area."

Moved by Mr. Allen, to add to the paragraph the words "without remuneration."

On the question being put, the Committee divided, and the names were taken down as follow:—

Ayes, 4.—Mr. Allen, Mr. Buchanan, Mr. Fraser, Mr. Massey

Noes, 5.—Mr. Graham, Mr. Hanan, Hon. Mr. Millar, Mr. Myers, Mr. Reed.

So it passed in the negative.

Paragraph (a) agreed to.

Paragraph (b). *Resolved*, on the motion of Mr. Allen, to insert after the word "estate" the words "and to make a complete investigation and valuation."

Paragraph (b) agreed to as amended.

Paragraph (c) read and agreed to.

Paragraph (d). Moved by Mr. Allen, to strike out the words "and rendered the aforesaid services."

On the question being put, the Committee divided, and the names were taken down as follow:—

Ayes, 4.—Mr. Allen, Mr. Buchanan, Mr. Fraser, Mr. Massey

Noes, 5.—Mr. Graham, Mr. Hanan, Hon. Mr. Millar, Mr. Myers, Mr. Reed.

So it passed in the negative.

Moved by Mr. Allen, to add the following words at the end of the paragraph "The evidence as to the time spent by Mr. Wilson on the estate is contradictory—Mr. Griffin states that Mr. Wilson spent two and a half days on the estate; Mr. Wilson asserts that he was at Flaxbourne from Sunday midday to the following Saturday morning. Accepting Mr. Wilson's statement, the Committee is of opinion that the time given by Mr. Wilson was not sufficient to make a 'complete investigation and valuation.'"