up and closed in at the hips and at the shoulders; but my father had his mental faculties right up to the last minutes before his death, and as soon as his mental faculties went his breath stopped.

Mr. Robertson objected to this line of cross-examination.

The Chairman ruled that the Minister was in order in going into past history. Resolved, That the Speaker's opinion be obtained in regard to the Chairman's ruling.

## WEDNESDAY, 8TH OCTOBER, 1913.

The Chairman: According to the resolution passed by this Committee at its last meeting I reported to the Speaker of the House for his ruling, and he upheld my ruling as to the relevance of certain questions.

Mr. Robertson: I would like just formally to put this letter in which I have here. As a result of Johnston's statement the other day about having been examined for life insurance, I asked the Chairman to apply to the Government Insurance Department for a copy of any certificate in their possession as to Johnston's health, and this is the reply :-

"Government Insurance Department, Head Office, Wellington, 7th October, 1913.

"SIR,—
"I am this moment in receipt of your letter of the 7th October relative to the above petition, and requesting a copy of the certificate supplied to this Department by Dr. Gore-Gillon in connection with his examination of the above petitioner on 20th July, 1911. In reply thereto I beg to advise you that no certificate in the ordinary acceptation of the term was supplied by Dr. Gore-Gillon on that occasion. He made the ordinary investigation into applicant's family and personal history, and also examined him physically. There was nothing in the papers reflecting in any way adversely upon Mr. Johnston, and in the summing-up the doctor reported that Mr. Johnston's constitution and health were satisfactory, and recommended his acceptance at first-class rates. He was accepted, and a policy issued accordingly. I may state that medical reports of this kind are regarded by the Department, and all other life insurance institutions, as of a most confidential character. I understand, however, that the information is desired in the interests of Johnston's petition, and that Dr. Gore-Gillon, having been applied to on the subject, has asked that the matter may be referred to this Department.

"I am, &c.,

"W. B. Hudson, Deputy Commissioner.

"The Chairman, Public Petitions A to L Committee, House of Representatives."

## THOMAS HENRY JOHNSTON further examined on oath. (No. 6.)

1. Hon. Mr. Fisher.] When we finished up the other day I think you had just told us about the manner of your father's death. You said you remember it when you were quite a child—you were about eight years old, I think?—Yes, I was eight years of age.

2. Do you remember what he died of?—Considering my age at the time, that is a question

which I would not be able to answer in a thorough manner.

3. When you were examined by Dr. Craig and Dr. Galligan in Waihi, did you give them any information at all about your family history?—I have already stated that I gave certain

information about my family history.

- 4. What was the nature of the information which you gave at the time?-That my grandfather, Nelson, as far as I know, is still alive, and if he is still alive he will now be 108 or 109 years of age. That is my mother's father. I also told him that my father's father and all the ancestors as far back as we could trace, also on my mother's side and my father's father's wife's
- side, all died between the age of sixty and seventy.

  5. Did you tell either Dr. Craig or Dr. Galligan that there was any epilepsy in the family? -Certainly not.

6. Can you suggest any reason why they should have certified to that effect—both of them?

-Yes, I can suggest a reason.

7. What is it?—Sergeant Wohlmann that day asked me about the time I went to the hospital in Auckland. He asked me what that illness was. I said it was abdominal cramp and also a heart-strain. Sergeant Wohlmann asked me who the doctor was, and I told him Dr. Kinder. He rang up on the telephone. Sergeant Wohlmann said that was epilepsy. I said, "Certainly it was not." I said I had never had epilepsy nor had any member of my family. That was the first of epilepsy that was ever mentioned in my case.

8. Was this conversation between Sergeant Wohlmann and yourself before the doctors

examined you?—It was after the doctors first interviewed me.

9. Can you fix the precise time of that interview?—Yes. It was the second time the doctors

10. You suggest, then, that Drs. Craig and Galligan both certified to epilepsy on the suggestion of Sergeant Wohlmann?—Certainly.

11. How do you know that Sergeant Wohlmann mentioned epilepsy to the doctors?—I do not know that he did.

12. Then how do you think that the doctors both arrived at the same decision on the question of epilepsy?—Because Sergeant Wohlmann spoke to them privately outside the door.