

was taken ill again on the 10th. We think Sergeant Yallop has mistaken the individuality of the case, for the sisters do not speak of any doctor having seen Colley on the 10th before he was sent to the hospital. The telegram to Colley's father was sent on the 10th, but it was too late to reach him in time to get over from Nelson, where he lived.

THE CASE OF CORPORAL PHILLIPS.

The history of this case was given to the Commission by a relative, Mr. Edward Legge. On the 29th May Corporal Phillips was sent to the Berhampore Hospital. On the following day his sister went to Trentham to see him, but was told that he had been sent to town to "the hospital." On inquiry at the Wellington Hospital two or three days later he was not there. The camp was rung up, but they could give no information. On the suggestion of the Wellington Hospital authorities Mr. Legge later on went to Berhampore, and ultimately saw him in the grounds there on Sunday, the 6th June. He told Mr. Legge he was feeling very well except for a pain in the back of the neck and a slight cough, and expected to be out on the following Wednesday. On Friday, the 11th June, he was removed to the Wellington Hospital. On Saturday, the 12th June, Mr. Legge received a telegram from Phillips's parents saying that Phillips was dangerously ill at the Wellington Hospital. Mr. Legge saw him that evening. Up to then Phillips had been delirious and been unable to give any account of himself. Mr. Legge saw him pretty well every night after that. Phillips died on the 1st July. His father arrived in time to see him. This patient's stay at Berhampore was while it was overcrowded. At that time it was not the practice to warn relatives of illness unless it was serious. Dr. Barclay, in giving evidence on other matters, was asked about this, but could not then recall the details. He subsequently sent us a memorandum as follows:—

"Wellington Hospital, 10th August, 1915.

"Edwin Phillips, aet. 21. Adm. 11/6/15.
"ADMITTED from Berhampore, where was sent from camp for measles; there three weeks very ill. Carried into ward on stretcher, quite irrational, throwing himself about in bed and moaning; could give no account of himself. Temperature, 102·4°. Placed under care of Dr. Clay. Diagnosis, pneumonia with meningitis; enteric fever suspected at one stage, test inconclusive. Remained delirious; died 1/7/15."

THE CASE OF PRIVATE ERNEST SMITH.

Evidence was given by his brother, Charles Smith, in good faith upon the information which he had received on the 4th July. This information was that Private Smith was in Wellington Hospital. He telegraphed to the hospital inquiring, and was told in reply that Private Smith had been discharged from the hospital on the 4th July. On the 7th information was sent from the camp that he was dangerously ill at Trentham. Telegrams to the same effect were sent on the 8th by the Medical Officers at Trentham. The relatives came at once, arriving on the morning of the 9th. He died the same day. The relatives believed that he had been improperly treated in having been discharged from hospital on the 4th and found seriously ill again almost immediately after. From inquiries set on foot by Mr. Skerrett, K.C., during the course of the Commission, it appears clear that the information given to the relatives in the first instance, and the deduction from it, was incorrect owing to a confusion in the name of Smith. It was another Smith who had been in Wellington Hospital. Private Ernest Smith was never there. The information first conveyed to the relatives must have been based on a misconception of their informant, and Dr. Barclay's reply to an inquiry about a Smith in the Wellington Hospital, and who was the only Private Smith there at the time, was quite natural. It appears also that Private Smith was never at Kaiwarra, but in Trentham Hospital only. In a letter from Dr. Valentine to Mr. Skerrett, the former states the facts as follows:—

- "(1.) Date of admission: 1st July, 1915.
- "(2.) Date of death: 8th July, 1915.
- "(3.) Cause of death: Cerebro-spinal meningitis.
- "(4.) Was never at Kaiwarra.
- "(5.) Condition during his stay in hospital: No information available as the nurse attending and the Medical Officer are not here now.

"In addition to the particulars furnished, I may say that I have made further inquiries regarding this case, and understand Private Ernest Smith was admitted to the racecourse ward on the 1st July with the usual symptoms of influenza, which gradually became more severe, as was often the case with influenza patients during the epidemic. On the fourth day from admission head symptoms developed, and he was isolated in a small room adjoining the racecourse ward. The head symptoms became gradually worse, and the day before he died he was removed to the cerebro-spinal meningitis ward, where he developed the rash. Subsequently his condition went from bad to worse, and unconsciousness supervened, which continued until his death on the 8th July, seven days after admission to the hospital."